



**MINUTES OF THE
DETROIT BROWNFIELD REDEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
PUBLIC HEARING FOR THE
DISTRICT DETROIT TRANSFORMATIONAL BROWNFIELD REDEVELOPMENT PLAN**

**Monday, February 6, 2023
Held via Zoom
5:00 PM**

In attendance were:

Jennifer Kanalos (DEGC/DBRA)	Raymond Simpson (Council	J. Marie's iPhone
Cora Capler (DEGC/DBRA)	President Sheffield's Office)	Allyson Putt
Brian Vosburg (DEGC/DBRA)	Tyler Searcy (Council President	Jen R
Kenyetta Bridges (DEGC)	Sheffield's Office)	Imara Hyman
Nevan Shokar (DEGC)	Councilmember Scott Benson's	Kea
Catherine Frazier (DEGC)	Office	Lisa M. Rodriguez
Malinda Jensen (DEGC)	Kayleigh Lickliter (Detroit	Deb Sumner
Lanard Ingram (DEGC)	Documenters)	M Pope
Arthur Siegal (Taft)	Eastside Slate Board Member	Linda Bowie
Mike McLaughlin (ODM)	Halima Cassells	Susan Steigerwalt
Jose Lemus (Mayor's Office)	Landis Spencer	Phone number ending in 5007
John Valentine (ODM)	Toya	Erma Leaphart
Jake Austermann (Plante Moran)	Detroit's Otter.ai	Bob Sisler
Rian English-Barnhill (ODM)	C. Lucas	Yolanda Y Peoples
Keith Bradford (ODM)	HP	Greg Flynn-Sollish
Ryan Friedrichs (Related)	Linda Bowie	Terry Catchings
Andrew Cantor (Related)	Ponce D. Clay	Adam B.
Luke Polcyn (Mayor's Office)	Akilah W. Redmond	Annie O'Byrne
Aaron Goodman (City of Detroit)	Theo Pride (Detroit People's	iPhone 13 Pro Max
Edwina King (City of Detroit)	Platform)	Joshua Van Berkum
Eric Dueweke (DBRA Board)	Eric	Cindy Darrah
Kehoe	Diane Feeley	Norman
MP	Caleb Rose	Steve Hawring
Quinita Good	Tim Hinkle	Linda Campbell
JC Reindl	Rumi	Karen Hammer
iPhone	Craig D. Register	Kory Dondzilla
Bryan Amann	Aaron Bager	Samsung SM
BR Cities 3	Adeeba	Articia Bomer
Eden	Gwen Peoples	Chris Gilmer-Hill
CG H	E. Saenz	Kory Dondzilla
	Erica Firment	

Mr. Vosburg called the meeting to order at 5:05 PM.

Mr. Vosburg gave an overview of the structure of the public hearing and provided instructions to participants on how to utilize the Zoom software to ask questions and/or provide public comment.

Mr. Vosburg informed the hearing of the way tax increment financing works, the structure of the Detroit Brownfield Redevelopment Authority, and the tax increment financing request per the Brownfield Plan.



Mr. Cantor, Mr. Bradford, and Ms. English-Barnhill provided additional details regarding the redevelopment plans for the project locations, the planned programming for the developments, and more details about the anticipated jobs to be created by the project.

Mr. Vosburg opened the Question-and-Answer segment of the public hearing and stated that questions will be limited to one minute per person.

Ms. Cassells asked for clarification on how the Detroit Public Schools Community District (DPSCD) will be unaffected by the tax capture under the Plan, what is meant by DDA tax capture for schools, if the new jobs created by the projects will provide a living wage, and asked for a breakdown of the affordable residential unit sizes that will be included in the projects. Mr. Vosburg stated that under the Plan the school debt millages will not be captured and that the DDA captures the school millages and that the State of Michigan makes the DPSCD whole should they experience any loss of tax revenue. Mr. Cantor stated that the affordable unit mix will match the mix of units in the buildings with studio, one and two-bedroom units. Mr. Bradford added that the residential units will be made up of about 25% studio units, 50% one-bedroom units, and 25% two-bedroom units.

Susan Steigerwalt stated that she is concerned about the underfunding of the Detroit Public Libraries and asked what the anticipated rental rates will be for the affordable two-bedroom units. Mr. Cantor stated that he does not have the dollar amount for the anticipated rental rate for the affordable two-bedroom unit but that the rental rate will be based on the applicable AMI level for the unit type and that he estimates that to be about \$1,000 per month.

M Pope asked if the retail tenants will be implementing the “credit card only” policy that other retail establishments have been practicing in Downtown Detroit and asked how the Developer will be transparent about the hiring of Detroit residents for the construction jobs and the permanent jobs to be created by the projects and what their commitment is to the hiring of Detroit residents. Mr. Cantor stated that he would be willing to have further conversations about the “card only” policy that other retail establishments have been implementing in Downtown Detroit and stated that the Developer is working closely with Detroit at Work to make sure that the employment opportunities are available for Detroit residents and that they are committed to being transparent about local hiring throughout the construction process and are putting plans in place to be able to meet the requirements of the applicable Executive Orders related the hiring of Detroit residents.

Imara Hyman asked if there will be any bonds issued for the projects. Mr. Vosburg stated that there will not be any public bonds issued for the projects and that if there were going to be public bonds issued, it would require approval of the public body.

Kea asked what kind of claw-backs will be put in place in case the projects do not create the amount of jobs that are currently anticipated and asked what the anticipated wages are for the permanent jobs that are expected to be created by the projects. Mr. Vosburg stated that the tax incentive under the Plan is performance based and if the projects do not create the amount of jobs that are projected to be created, then the tax capture benefits under the Plan will be reduced accordingly and that the City of Detroit’s Housing and Revitalization Department will be enforcing the affordable residential rates, the Civil Rights, Inclusion, and Opportunity Department will be monitoring the hiring of Detroit residents for the construction of the projects under the applicable Executive Orders, and the Planning and Development Department will be monitoring the Community Benefits Agreement that will be entered into as a result of the Community Benefits Ordinance process. Mr. Cantor stated that the Related Companies have decades of experience with affordable housing development and that they have never converted an affordable housing unit to market rate rents. Ms. English-Barnhill stated that the permanent jobs to be created will be a variety of



opportunities in hospitality and banking such as loan officers, bank tellers, computer system analysts, as well as a variety of other opportunities that will be created by the future office and retail tenants of the projects.

Robert asked what the benefits of the projects will be for long-time Detroit residents. Mr. Cantor stated that there will be more job opportunities, increased revenue for the City of Detroit for City services which will increase from the current \$250,000 in revenue that is being received by the City to approximately \$10 million in new revenue for the City that will be created by the projects, and that the projects will create new green spaces in the community.

Landis Spencer asked for clarification on the income tax capture included in the Plan and the projected increase in revenue for the City that will come as a result of the projects. Mr. Vosburg stated that the income tax capture that is included in the Plan is 50% of the state income tax generated by the future employees of the projects and clarified that the City income tax will not be captured under the Plan and that the City will see the benefits of the increase of City income tax that will be generated by the future employees and residents of the projects.

Quinita Good asked for more information on the rental rates for the residential units and what the anticipated wages are for the jobs to be created by the projects. Mr. Cantor stated that the Developer is working with the Detroit Public Schools Community District to make employment and educational opportunities available to students in the DPSCD and the Developer is working on solving the problem of the shortage of skilled trades workers and will encourage the future commercial tenants to hire Detroit residents.

Citing no additional questions, Mr. Vosburg closed out the Question-and-Answer segment and opened the floor for public comment stating that public comments would be limited to one minute per person.

Theo Pride stated that the Plan will hurt majority black Detroit and will displace black people, while redistributing resources from the black public to private white pocket books of the proposed benefits fall short in addressing the needs of the average Detroit resident, the affordable housing proposed for the project of 50% AMI does not go deep enough to truly be affordable to the black population in the area as their annual income ranges from \$17,000 to \$28,000. Mr. Pride stated that these people will surely be displaced as the rents rise due to escalating property values based on prior evidence job creation and this deal will benefit white suburbanites more than legacy Detroit residents and that more than 75% of all the jobs in Detroit are held by suburban residents, and the average annual income of a job in Detroit is \$85,000.

Adam stated that the affordable housing units included in the project are not affordable enough for the average Detroit resident and that the AMI calculation is inherently unfair for the average income in the City of Detroit.

M Pope stated that he is part of the Business Community Association and the city-wide CBA Coalition and requested that the Developer make a \$1 million annual contribution to the Detroit Affordable Housing Trust Fund over the life of the tax abatement periods and stated that the projects will displace low-income residents with children as well as low-income senior residents within the impact area.

Robert stated that the projects will not benefit the rest of the City of Detroit because the projects and the tax capture will stay downtown.

Steven Hawring stated that there was some misinformation stated by some of the previous commenters but that he does have some concerns about the levels of affordability proposed for the housing units still



not being attainable for the average Detroit resident and expressed concerns about the proposed amount of office space included in the projects and whether there would be enough demand to fill the office space.

Imara Hyman stated that she is concerned about the amount of the tax incentives being pursued for the projects and that the City of Detroit awards a higher amount of tax incentives per capita than other cities in the country.

Tim Hinkle stated that the history of unfulfilled promises by Olympia Development are concerning and if those promises had been fulfilled, we would have a walkable district where buildings have since been demolished by Olympia Development and he would like to know why development can be proposed and completed in other cities but not in the City of Detroit.

Landis Spencer stated that the proposed levels of affordability are not attainable by the average Detroit resident and that Olympia Development has failed to deliver on past promises and do not maintain the properties that they own in the City and that the tax capture should not go to the Developer and should go to the City of Detroit for other services.

Chris Gilmer-Hill stated that he is against the tax incentives being pursued for the projects and that you can't trust that the proposed benefits of the projects will actually go to Detroit residents and that the Developer has not followed through on past development proposals and he does not trust that they will deliver on the proposed projects now.

Caleb Rose stated that he has a lot of issues with the Transformational Brownfield Plan program and that the Developer has proven in the past that they will not deliver on their promises of development and expressed concerns that there will be low-income residents displaced and the tax revenues should go toward helping those residents retain their housing throughout the City.

Greg Flynn-Sollish stated that he is against approval of the Plan, and he does not think that public funds should go to the Developer for the projects and that the projects will not serve Detroit residents.

Aaron B stated that he is a member of the Democratic Socialists of America, and that Olympia Development has not delivered on past promises and when they said they were going to build residential developments, they instead built a parking structure to meet their investment requirements to the DDA, and stated that the Developer does not seem to be taking the residents of Detroit seriously.

Gwen Peoples stated that she sent in a written public comment and that the proposed developments look like they will be closed off from people outside and be inaccessible to the public and that the City needs funds for libraries and parks and to help residents stay in their homes and not be displaced.

Deb Sumner stated that Detroit residents need to revisit the structure of the DDA tax capture and that there should be a cap on the amount of tax capture that the DDA can receive and that she is against corporate welfare.

Erica Firment stated that she is a resident of Farmington Hills, and that she is against the approval of the tax incentives for the project and doesn't understand why there is so much office space proposed as part of the projects because there isn't enough demand for it.

Quinita Good stated that she would like to know who is on the DBRA-CAC and that they didn't consider the needs to Detroit residents when they recommended approval of the Plan.



Cindy Darrah stated that she wanted to know more about the AMI calculation and the geographical area that the City uses for its AMI and that she would like to know what the proposed rental rates are the affordable housing units.

Citing no additional public comments, Mr. Vosburg provided a recap on the next steps in the approval process for the Plan, restated that written public comments can be submitted to Cora Capler via email at ccapler@degc.org until 5:00pm on Tuesday, February 7, 2023 to be included in the minutes of the public hearing, and then closed the public hearing at 6:43 PM.

2/6/2023

My name is Tarios Porter, lifelong Detroiter, District 5 resident, and member of the Northwest Young Organizers. I am writing to oppose the Transformational Brownfield for the new The District Detroit development.

My reasons are many. First, the District Detroit development is racist and will rob black people of public investments and displace black people in order to provide profit and comfort for white people. Over \$600 million dollars, \$200 million of which will come from our schools and libraries, is an absurd amount of public money to give to wealthy developers when so many Detroiters are mired in poverty, unemployed, in need of affordable housing, a better transit system, and education. That \$600 million is need to address the problems Detroiters face, not so the billionaire Illitches can make super-profit. This project prioritizes white profit of black lives.

Instead of luxury hotels and office space that no one will use, we want better schools, more affordable housing, development that includes everybody instead of pushing us out of our homes. Thus, I am asking, if the Brownfield Board approves the Transformational Brownfield, that the developers 1) make a \$1 million contribution to the city's Housing Trust Fund over the entire life of the tax capture; 2) reimburse the Detroit Public Schools Community District and Detroit Public Library for any lost revenue as a result of the eligible tax capture; and 3) invest in a Dislocation Fund to support any resident displaced as a result of rent increase caused by the luxury development.

Thank you for your time and consideration. With your help, we can make this development equitable for all.

Sincerely,

Tarios Porter

Cora Capler

From: R Weaver <mwmweaver446@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, February 6, 2023 6:44 PM
To: Cora Capler
Subject: Comment on District Detroit

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Hello,

I am writing as a resident of Detroit to express my strong displeasure, and active irritation at this proposal of the District Detroit Brownfield. There are so many funds that have been directed to that area already among so much suffering within the city, that it feels deeply unconscionable to try and support this project even further - knowing full well that the funds that go into this area get trapped into this area for many years.

Sure, there is the but-for cause that always gets brought up when it comes to this kind of development. But if so much relies on this kind of exploitative funding, then this is not the kind of development that I want to support in any way whatsoever and I'm going to be very, very honest about that.

--

R.Weaver
[they/them/theirs]

Cora Capler

From: Jane Slaughter <janesla@sbcglobal.net>
Sent: Monday, February 6, 2023 9:52 PM
To: Cora Capler
Subject: comment on proposed Illitch tax giveaway

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

To: City Council
From: Jane Slaughter, 1451 Clark St., Detroit, MI 48209

There is no justification for giving the wealthy Illitch family even one cent of the tax dollars that we Detroiters so badly need for our own services. This sort of corporate welfare has never brought about the promised benefits, starting with the construction of the Poletown plant and up to the present. Rather, it has contributed to the growth of poverty in Detroit and such disgraceful situations as a bus system that does not work because bus drivers are offered only \$15 an hour. Keep our tax dollars, pay bus drivers, build public housing--not expensive, subsidized private housing. The idea that this scheme will build housing that is "affordable" is laughable. And those who pursue gentrification rather than true development know this.

I urge City Council to reject any more "rob from the poor, give to the rich" schemes.

Cora Capler

From: Renard Monczunski <renard@detroitpeoplesplatform.org>
Sent: Tuesday, February 7, 2023 3:09 PM
To: Cora Capler; Info
Subject: Vote NO on the District Detroit Tax Abatement Deal

To the Members of the Brownfield Redevelopment Board:

I am a resident of Detroit and I am opposed to the District Detroit tax abatement deal.

Detroiters have already invested hundreds of millions of public tax dollars in Little Caesar's arena including major land give aways. I believe these wealthy billionaires like the Ilitch Family and Stephen Ross should pay for the District Detroit Development with their own money and not continue to rely on support from city and state tax payers.

The Brownfield Authority Board should vote NO on the deal.

Thank you,

Renard L. Monczunski